

Office of the Director  
50 W. Gay St.  
Columbus, Ohio 43215-9040  
(614) 645-8591  
(614) 645-6675 (FAX)

Planning Division  
50 W. Gay St.  
Columbus, Ohio 43215-9040  
(614) 645-8664

Downtown Commission  
Daniel J. Thomas (Staff)  
Urban Design Manager  
(614) 645-8404  
djthomas@columbus.gov

## DOWNTOWN COMMISSION RESULTS

**Tuesday, November 17, 2015**

**77 N. Front Street, Stat Room (Lower Level)**

### **I. Attendance**

Present: Steve Wittmann (Chair), Otto Beatty, Jr., Michael Brown, Tedd Hardesty, Kyle Katz, Robert Loversidge, Mike Lusk,

Absent: Jana Maniace, Danni Palmore

City Staff: Daniel Thomas, Dan Bletschschmidt, , Kelly Scocco, Ashley Senn

### **II. Approval of the October 20, 2015 Downtown Commission Meeting Results**

### **III. Requests for Certificate of Appropriateness**

#### **Case #1 15-11-1**

0:1:07

**Address:** 382-404 East Main Street

**Applicant and Architect:** M&A Architects

**Property Ownership** (current): 382 E. Main – K F IV Limited Partnership  
404 E. Main – Klean A Car Inc.

(future): Grant Hotel Partners LLC

**Attorney:** Jack Reynolds (Smith & Hale LLC)

#### **Request:**

- 1.) Final Certificate of Appropriateness Approval for mixed use project comprised of hotel, ground floor retail fronting Main Street and structured parking behind. CC3359.05(C)1). Demolition of 382 E. Main St. and 404 E. Main St. 3359.23
- 2.) Downtown Commission approval of drive thru as per CC3359.17 – Uses Permitted Only by Certificate of Appropriateness. *Property owner notification within 125 ft.*

*The project was conceptually reviewed in August and in October. Please refer to the attached Results from the October meeting.*

#### **Discussion**

M + A Architects – site plan and elevations remain largely the same. On the eastside entrance to the hotel is more visible and accessible from the street. The adjacent parking is also angled. Drive thrus also occur in this locale at McDonald's and Donato's. The entry to the facility on the east side is from both east and west bound on Main St. , but the drive in the facility is one way. SW – concerns expressed about the door on the east still being not visible.

Elevation does not reflect the changes but the renderings do. SW – provide architectural drawings accordingly. RL – This is an improvement. OB – Mt. Olive – some concerns with 5 story height. Description of materials. TH – consistency with downtown streetscape standards. SW – speaker for ordering at coffee shop? Location. RL – question about adjacent building, are there windows? Also the utility area in the back? A. – could be landscaped. RL - Bring back photographs of utility area.

KK – move for approval. Come back with landscape (including sidewalk) , signage, lighting. RL - Identify ordering box, relate that to the adjacent apartments.

### **Results**

Motion to approve with the condition for return of landscape (including sidewalk) signage and lighting. Identify speaker box, relate that to the adjacent apartments. (7-0)

### **Case #2a 15-11-2a**

0:17:00

**Address:** 205 South High Street

Trautman Building

**Applicant:** Lifestyle Communities

**Property Owner:** The Annex at Riversouth II LLC (Lifestyle Communities)

**Design Professional:** David B. Meleca Architects LLC

### **Request** CC3359.05, CC3359.07(A)

Certificate of Appropriateness for revisions to a previously approved 8 story building (comprised of 1.) 7 stories of apartments, 2.) High Street ground level retail and 3.) parking level accessed from Ludlow Street). The revisions are for the following facades

- Lower portion of west (rear) façade
- Portions of the courtyard facades (east and west)

### **Discussion**

Chase Miller, Lifestyle Communities – delays with construction. Should resume. Simplifying some of the expression in the rear. Hierarchy of expression. These are very much signature buildings for Lifestyle. High St. and Rich St. elevations for both buildings remain unchanged. KK – move to accept. Compliments to the developer for bringing these changes back.

### **Result**

Move to approve (7-0)

### **Case #2b 15-11-2b**

**Address:** 229-245 South High Street - Beatty Building

**Applicant:** Lifestyle Communities

**Property Owner:** Annex at Riversouth III LLC (Lifestyle Communities)

**Design Professional:** David B. Meleca Architects LLC

### **Request** CC3359.05,

Certificate of Appropriateness for revisions to a previously approved 10 story building (comprised of 1.) 9 stories of apartments, 2.) High Street ground level retail and 3.) parking level accessed from Ludlow Street). The revisions are for the following facades:

- Lower portion of west (rear) façade
- Portions of the courtyard facades (east and west)

**Result**

Move to approve (7-0)

**Case #3 15-11-3**

25:08

**Address:** 261 S. Front Street

**Matan Project**

**Applicant & Property Owner:** 261 Front, Ltd. (Lifestyle Communities)

**Architect:** Niles Bolton Associates (Atlanta)

**Request:**

Certificate of Appropriateness for a five story mixed use project comprised of apartments (4 floors), ground floor retail at the corner of Front and Main and two levels of structured parking. Would necessitate the demolition of current 261 S. Front St. (pictured below) CC3359.05(C)1), 3359.23

**Discussion**

Applicant - Bringing this for final review. Desire for demolition, could bring the bulk by in December. Additional handout with more information distributed. Existing conditions and surrounding context shown. Some concern expresses about entry area. At this time, 88 E. Main will be cordoned off. Elevations shown. Three distinct parts of the building – more ornate at the corner of Front and Main, modern connection / entrance and “warehouse” motif elsewhere. Materials shown.

KK – How long will the area on the western part of Main St. be unfilled? A. – town house in design right now, should be coming back in the next couple of months. Probably three stories, which was done to relate to 88 E. Main. RL – nice project, please that 88 Main will be kept. Concern with the connecting piece, encourage you to go back and look at it. Connection / entrance idea is good, but the other two pieces are strong and this one doesn’t do it. Maybe recede more. Favorable review. We need to see more detail. Dimensions, site, materials.

**Result**

No vote taken. Regarded as conceptual.

**Case #4 15-9-1**

38:25

**Address:** 85-111 North High Street

**Applicant and Property Owner:** 85 North High Street LLC c/o Eclipse Real Estate

**Design Professional :** Kephart – Community • Planning • Architecture (Denver)

**Request:**

Certificate of Appropriateness for a mixed use project comprised of apartments (4 levels), ground floor retail fronting High Street and structured parking (3 levels). CC3359.05(C)1)

*This project was conceptually reviewed by the Commission in July. See Results from that meeting.*

**Discussion**

Jeff Edwards – there have not been substantive changes since initial conceptual review. Material, details, contextual relationship and further definition of north end of site will be dealt with. Will be connected underground to 51 N. High. Description of project given. SW – you are asking for CoA for everything except north end above the second floor? A. - Yes. We were pursuing a hotel, but there is too much uncertainty with that. We want to get in the ground in February. We’ll be

adding 56 more units at the north end. Another residential tower geared for the contemporary. No more curb cut on Long St. Underground parking for entire site, pulled back slightly from the R.O.W. At grade retail and restaurant with another level of parking behind. Haven't figured out the public or private nature of garage. Parking (@ 400 in total) on second level with apartments fronting High St. Apartments on floors 3, 4, 5 & 6. Discussion on comparative contextual massing. Favorable review. Desire for more detail.

SW – seeking clarification on what is to be approved today. Tom Marano – exterior materials. SW – questions @ lintels – we're going to have to see details, dimensions. SW – we want to see what you are going to build, i.e. – size of the mullions. I don't think anybody here has a problem with what you're proposing, but we need to have specifics. You might already have them, you need to get them to us. JE – our drawings have not yet caught up with where we want to be. We would like to get started on the garage. Would like foundation start. Samples shown – brick, windows (vinyl and also alum. clad), limestone, bronze storefront aluminum, bronze metal panels, cast stone window surrounds. RL – suggest that you take another look at the brick choices – not sure you are getting the contrast that you want. Building is very handsome. SW – I like the brick selection. SW – what about railings on the balconies? TM – dark bronze accents. JE – would like to get started with garage excavation – can come back with details and conceptual review for the north end design. TM – Questions about what would be compliant for details. SW – we don't need 3D to see again floor plans. RL – would like to see a detailed site plan. SW – finalization of terraces. Come back later with lighting and signage. A small vest pocket park is planned on Gay Street.

### **Result**

Motion for approval for Certificate for foundation and site compliance. Will return with more detail and for conceptual review of far north portion. (7-0)

### **Case #5 15-11-4**

1:08

**Address:** 250 West Spring Street (Tentative address)

**Parks Edge Condos**

**Applicant:** Nationwide Realty Investors

**Property Owner:** NWD Investments, LLC

**Design Professionals:** HOK, MKSK

### **Request:**

Certificate of Appropriateness for the construction of a 12 story condominium and a 4 level parking structure. CC3359.05(C)1)

### **Discussion**

Brian Ellis – this will be a three phase project, the first phase the 12 story building (69 unit condo) at the corner at Neil and Spring, a connected 2 story lobby and a parking garage (320 + / - spaces) connected by pedestrian bridge. The other phases will be another 12 story building to the east and lower a building similar to Burnham Square facing McPherson Commons. This includes a temporary parking lot where future phases will be built. The garage will support future phases too. Complete design and ready to go. The parking garage might support other uses until build out of all phases. Every unit has a balcony, there will be lots of glass on floors 3 to 12. Stone base on the first 2 floors for pedestrian scale. Base along Spring St. will have similar character to McPherson Commons. Residents and guest will enter into the 2 story lobby / atrium. There will be a patio / terrace to the south. RL – no entrance from Spring Street? It's a little odd that the entire block doesn't have access from Spring. It's all internal. A. – choice made to approach from

parking and drive. First two levels are 2 level townhomes. On the south side the units will be entered from a common corridor, on the north side there will be direct access from a private drive. The south facing ground units will have patios overlooking the skyline and riverfront. 4½ ' terrace height. We want this space to remain private. This will be well landscaped as exclusive private residence. RL – How does drive work with the eye center? A. – Eye Center is primarily valet parking.

There will be a two story atrium space with connection to the bridge leading to parking. The atrium will open up to a two story glass area to the south with views to the downtown skyline. Materials were discussed. JR – some sign opportunities – one along Spring St. at base of terrace. SW – bring it back when you have the specifics. HOK – lighting described as minimal. Animation (video) shown. Temporary graphic for leasing – to be reviewed by staff and Chair.

**Result:**

Motion to approve. (6-0) (Brown left)

**Case #6 15-11-5**

1:46:50

**Address:** 330 E. Oak Street.

**Applicant and Architect:** Jonathan Barnes Architecture and Design

**Property Owner:** Boehringer Ingelheim Roxane Inc.

**Developer:** The Stonehedge Company Mo Dioun

**Request** CC3359.07A

Certificate of Appropriateness for the construction of a new 9-story apartment: 3 levels of above ground parking (some apartments on level 3); 6 full floors of apartments above parking, and lounge fronting Capital Street on the ground level.

*The Downtown Commission has heard cases concerning 330 Oak Street numerous times. The last time brought before the Commission was September of this year (see Results). At that time the applicant was seeking general approval of revised plans and specific approval for foundation and garage start, with later return for more information on regarding landscaping, signage and lighting.*

*The applicant has elected to start the entire project in the spring of 2016 and has returned with pertinent information for final approval.*

**Discussion**

Johnathan Barnes – Building start in February or March, 2016. Materials – Jen Gilmore. Double coating will keep red color, manufacturer's warranty in packet (15 years). SW - There are two tones on the elevations – are you still going to do that? A – Yes. Standard red has been provided as a sample, the darker red on the building is a custom. Predominant color and accent. SW & KK – looks more orange. SW – come back with the red. Louvers, parking screening, window framing, etc.

Working with Capital Law. The future of Capital St. has not been worked out. TH – has been working on beginning, not necessarily connect with this project. Landscaping – tall grasses at entry, bike racks have been moved inside the parking structure. Foundation is off of property line,

which gives an opportunity for modest planting. SW – question about and suggestion for irrigation. There is some seating along Capital St. – intent is to activate. Exterior lighting and signage – bollard lights are at east alley. Clarification as to where courtyard. Minimal signage. Name is connected to place. Potential for signage on west wall - hasn't been decided on and will come back for this. RL – move.

**Result:**

Motion to approve. Come back with true color samples. (5-1-0) Hardesty abstaining

**V.Request for Certificate of Appropriateness for Advertising Mural**

**Case #7 15-11-6M**

2:07:00

**If You Gamble ad mural**

**Address:** 34 N. High Street – North Elevation

**Applicant:** Orange Barrel Media

**Property Owner:** Thirty Four Corp

**Design Professional:** Orange Barrel Media

**Request:**

Design review and approval for the installation of a vinyl mesh advertising mural to be located on the north elevation at 34 N. High Street. Proposed mural is for “If you gamble, be the 95%”. There have been numerous as murals at this location, the current being for another “95%” ad mural. CC3359.07(D).

*The original 95% mural was approved by the Commission in Sept. 2015. The client wishes to extend the campaign and have a more effective graphic.*

**Dimensions of mural:** 20’W x 33’H, two dimensional, non lit

**Term of installation:** Seeking approval from Dec. 1, 2015 through Mar. 31, 2016.

**Area of mural:** 660 sf

**Approximate % of area that is text:** Depends on definition of what constitutes text: 6.5%, not including “95%” incased in shape of Ohio; 11.6% including “95%”

**Result:**

Motion to approve. (6-0)

**Case #8 15-11-7M**

**St. Jude Children’s Research Hospital ad mural**

**Address:** 64 E. Broad Street

**Applicant:** Orange Barrel Media

**Property Owner:** KT Partners LLC

**Design Professional:** Orange Barrel Media

**Request:**

Design review and approval for installation of a vinyl mesh advertising mural to be located on the east elevation of 64 E. Broad Street. Proposed mural — St. Jude Children’s Research Hospital - “Give . . .”. There have been numerous murals at this site, the last being for The United Way.

CC3359.07(D).

**Dimensions of mural:** 20'W x 32'H, two dimensional, non lit

**Term of installation:** Seeking approval from November 13 through December 31, 2015

**Area of mural:** 640 sf

**Approximate % of area that is text:** 4%

**Result:**

Motion to approve. (6-0)

**Case #9 15-11-8M**

**St. Jude Children's Research Hospital Ad Mural**

**274 S. Third Street**

**Applicant:** Orange Barrel

**Property Owner:** Devere LLC

**Design Professional:** Orange Barrel

**Request:**

Design review and approval for installation of vinyl mesh advertising murals to be located on the north elevation at 274 S. Third St. Proposed mural – St. Jude Children's Research Hospital "Give . . .". The Downtown Commission has previously approved numerous murals at this location, the latest being for T-Mobile. CC3359.07(D)

**Dimensions of mural:** 28'6"W x 20'5"H Two dimensional, non lit

**Term of installation:** Seeking approval from November 13 through December 31, 2015

**Area of mural:** 581.9 sf

**Approximate % of area that is text:** 4%

**Result:**

Motion to approve. (6-0)

**VI. Business / Discussion**

**Harrison Smith Award**

Noon, Wednesday, December 2

Columbus Metropolitan Club at The Athletic Club

Commissioners Table: Steve Wittmann, Michael Brown, Tedd Hardesty, Danni Palmore, Jana Maniace, Robert Loversidge, Daniel Thomas, Kyle Katz

**Tomorrow**

2pm Wednesday, November 18 discussion with retail expert

Capital Crossroads SID Office, 45 N. Fourth

Michael Brown, Daniel Thomas

**Thursday, November 19, 4-6 pm Atheneum**

Capital Crossroads Discovery Districts Annual meeting – see handout

**Election of Chair and Vice Chair**

As per By-Laws

Steve Wittmann (Chair) and Otto Beatty, Jr. (Vice Chair) renominated and confirmed by proclamation

**Reflection on C.A.M.P. program held Nov. 14.**

**Public Forum**

Staff Certificates of Appropriateness have been issued since last meeting (September 22, 2015)

1. 273 E. Gay St. – Midland Garage roofing
2. 106 Vine St. – Seasonal tent
3. 144 N. Wall St. – Roofing
4. 62 E. Broad St.- Dispatch signage
5. 101 E. Town St. – Daycare signage
6. 104 W. Main St. – Canopy –awning replacement
7. 300 W. Broad St. – New vets construction sign
8. Neil & Spring – lot split
9. 375 N Front St. – MT Business Technology sign
10. Winter Park – McFereson Commons
11. 88 E. Broad St. – Roofing
12. 21 E. State St. – AT&T antennas

**If you have questions concerning this agenda, please contact Daniel Thomas, Urban Design Manager, Planning Division at 645-8404.**